



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

| APPLICATION NO.  | FILING DATE | FIRST NAMED INVENTOR | ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.           | CONFIRMATION NO. |
|--|-------------|----------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|
| 10/065,545   | 10/29/2002  | Rajendra K. Singh    | GEPL.P-053                    | 7676             |
| 21121  | 7590        | 01/21/2004           | EXAMINER                      |                  |
| OPPEDAHL AND LARSON LLP<br>P O BOX 5068<br>DILLON, CO 80435-5068 |             |                      | SANDERS, KRIELLION ANTIONETTE |                  |
|  |             |                      | ART UNIT                      | PAPER NUMBER     |
|  |             |                      | 1714                          |                  |

DATE MAILED: 01/21/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

# Office Action Summary

Application No.

10/065,545

Applicant(s)

SINGH ET AL.

Examiner

Kriellion A. Sanders

Art Unit

1714

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

## Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE three MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).
- Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

## Status

- 1) ☐ Responsive to communication(s) filed on \_\_\_\_.
- 2a) ☐ This action is FINAL. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

## Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-75 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) \_\_\_\_ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-75 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

## Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on \_\_\_\_ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.  
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
- 11) ☐ The proposed drawing correction filed on \_\_\_\_ is: a) ☐ approved b) ☐ disapproved by the Examiner.  
If approved, corrected drawings are required in reply to this Office action.
- 12) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner.

## Priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 119 and 120

- 13) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).  
a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some \* c) ☐ None of:  
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.  
2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_.  
3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).  
\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.
- 14) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(e) (to a provisional application).  
a) ☐ The translation of the foreign language provisional application has been received.
- 15) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 120 and/or 121.

## Attachment(s)

- 1) ☒ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413) Paper No(s). \_\_\_\_
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
- 3) ☒ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449) Paper No(s) 1. 6) ☐ Other: .

Art Unit: 1714

1. The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

2. Claims 1-75 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as obvious over Nouvertne' US patent No. 3,775,367 in view of Mark et al. US patent No. 3,933,734.
3. Applicant's invention pertains to a method for making a flame retarded polycarbonate resin comprising adding a combination of a potassium salt of a perfluoroalkane sulfonate and a sodium salt of toluene sulfonic acid in prescribed amounts, to a high melt strength polycarbonate. Additional use of an antidrip agent is optional. The invention also relates to the resulting polycarbonate composition and the composition of the flame retardants alone.
4. Nouvertne' discloses the addition of metal salts of fluoroalkane sulphonates such as the potassium perfluorobutane sulphonate in an amount of 0.01 to 1.0 percent by weight to "high melt strength" polycarbonate resin to render it flame retardant. Patentee provides for the addition of other conventional additives. See col 1, line 46 through col. 2 line 57.
5. Mark et al discloses the addition of metal salts of aromatic sulfonic acids in an amount of 0.01 to 10.0 percent by weight to "high melt strength" polycarbonate resin to render it flame retardant. Patentee provides for the use of mixtures of the metal salts. See col 1, line 43 through col. 2 line 49.
6. Since Nouvertne' indicates that the salts of his invention may be combined with other conventional additives, and since Mark et al discloses that the salts of his invention may be used in combination. The ordinary practitioner would have found it plausible to utilize more than one

Art Unit: 1714


such salt in formulating a flame retardant composition., Therefor, it would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of applicant's invention to employ a combination of metal salts of fluoroalkane sulphonantes as taught by Nouvertne' and the metal salts of aromatic sulfonic acids taught by Mark et al in the amounts set forth by patentees with the expectation of achieving an additive effect in flame retardancy. The two types of salts are shown to have equivalent functionalities.

7. Prior art cited on form PTO 892 provides technological background information.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Kriellion A. Sanders whose telephone number is 703-308-2435. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday through Thursday 6:30-7:00.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Vasu Jagannathan can be reached on 703-306-2777. The fax phone numbers for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned are 703-872-9306 for regular and After Final communications.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or proceeding should be directed to the receptionist whose telephone number is 703-308-2351.

  
Kriellion A. Sanders  
Primary Examiner  
Art Unit 1714

ks  
January 10, 2004